Reducing Lateral Bullying Towards Newly Graduated Registered Nurses

Nicole Kim and Jaclyn Stears
Sandra McCormick, PhD, RN, Faculty Sponsor
NRS 410: Research and Evidence Based Practice
Elmhurst College, Elmhurst, Illinois

Background

- Transitioning as a new graduate nurse can lead to high turnover and decreased quality of patient care (Dwyer & Hunter Revell, 2016).
- Results vary widely (from 19.0-86.5%), but show that at least 1 in 5 nurses have encountered workplace bullying (Kang, Kim, & Yun, 2017).
- Studies have found that 14% of new graduate nurses had plans to quit their current job, and 18% had left their job and found another already (Dwyer & Hunter Revell, 2016).
- Workplace bullying may lead to the intimidation and ultimately high turnover of newly graduated nurses by older and more experienced nurses.

Purpose

In new graduate Registered Nurses, what is the effect of lateral bullying in a traditional workplace on job satisfaction and performance compared with partaking in mutual respect in a positive organizational culture?

Methods

Search Limitations

- Studies written in English
- Studies published between 2015 and 2020
- Studies with a nurse as an author and/or published in a nursing journal
- Studies with the keyword "bullying"

Sources: CINAHL and PubMed

Keywords: workplace bullying; new graduate; lateral violence; nurs*; bully*; turnover

Three systematic reviews and one randomized controlled trial (RCT utilized)

Results

Analysis

Reference	Research Question	Study Design	Sample	Assessment	Results
Dwyer, 2016 Level III Evidence (fair)	What are the factors that influence new graduate nurse transition difficulty into practice?	Systematic Review The Social Ecological Model	n= 42 articles published from January 1, 2001, to June 1, 2015 All non-experimental quantitative studies	Searched: new graduate nurses & related terms Intrapersonal, interpersonal, and organizational level influences on new graduate nurse transition	Factors categorized as: Intrapersonal: educational preparation (inverse relationship between career satisfaction and level of educational preparation); psychological capital Interpersonal: significant role of incivility as related to novice RN's mental health Organizational: work attitudes and work-variables, especially structural empowerment
Johnson, 2020 Level III (poor)	Does bullying contribute to mistakes in the nursing profession?	Qualitative Synthesis PICOT format	n= 14 non-experimental studies, all of nurses	Search terms: nurs* AND bully* OR lateral violence OR workplace violence OR horizontal violence OR mobbing OR incivility AND error.	Although causes are still unknown, bullying in nursing does impact the incidence of workplace mistakes. 4 themes: work-environment influence on errors, individual-level connections (bullying-errors), barriers to teamwork & communication impairment. Variation in instruments used to assess bullying. Studies used: Practice Environment Scale-Nursing Work Index, Negative Acts Questionnaire-Revised, Collegial Nurse-Physician subscale of the PES-NWI survey, and Hospital Survey on Patient Safety Culture questions
Kang, 2017 Level 1 (poor)	Is workplace bullying to blame for the high turnover rate of nurses? Intervention: Cognitive Rehearsal Program (CRP) to reduce impact of bullying	RCT Cognitive Rehearsal composition (Smith); Non-violent communication technique (Rosenburg & Chopra)	n= 40 nurses working at different hospitals in South Korea	Turnover, via Yun's nurse turnover intention tool. Interpersonal relationships, workplace bullying, symptom experience, and turnover intention measured with: 1.Relationship Change Scale 2. Negative Acts Questionnaire – Revised 3. Brief Symptom Inventory-18	Turnover intention was reduced with the introduction of the CRP, however, this was not statistically significant (p=0.054) Other measures (RCS, NAQ, BSI) did not show significant change (between groups or over time; n.s.: p=.144 to .609).
Pfeifer, 2017 Level III (poor)	Can Magnet accredited hospitals decrease the amount of bullying that takes place among nursing staff?	Systematic Review Magnet Model	n = 11 articles published between January 2008 and February 2017 (8 quantitative and 3 qualitative studies)	Search terms: bullying, lateral violence, horizontal violence, workplace violence, social aggression, mobbing, incivility AND nurse, nursing AND magnet organization, magnet hospital and magnet.	All studies concluded that when nurses feel supported by the community of their workplace, they have higher retention, patient safety outcomes, and job satisfaction. Multiple measures of bullying/lateral violence: Briles' Sabotage Questionnaire, Negative Acts Questionnaire-Revised, Nursing Incivility Scale, Verbal Abuse Scale

Discussion

Levels of evidence

- Dwyer, 2016 – Level III evidence (Fair)
  - Methods were quantitative and may have left out information.
- Johnson, 2020 – Level III evidence (Poor)
  - The inclusion and exclusion material was very strict, which may have limited the study too much.
- Kang, 2017 – Level I evidence (Poor)
  - This sample size was very small and limited to one city.
- Pfeifer, 2017 - Level III evidence (Poor)
  - This was the first systematic review on this subject so it may need further research.

Study limitations and weaknesses

- Studies were unable to have a generalizable sample size. They were often too uniform or limited due to their population.
- There is no universal definition for "bullying"
- Sample sizes were relatively small.
- Overall evidence was weak

Overall Results

- .If a generalized defintion could be clarified for bullying, it may create a better direction for the studies.
- Larger sample sizes in multiple cities may create better data results.

Conclusions

- New graduate RNs are facing lateral bullying in the traditional workplace setting, resulting in decreased job satisfaction and performance.
- Because of the small sample sizes, studies should be limited to new graduate RNs in the U.S. and in Magnet hospitals.

Future research should include:

- Multiple locations/cities and larger sample sizes to increase reliability.
- Observation of changes in overall morale over time through longitudinal studies.
- Ways to identify bullying in the field and implement methods to educate employees about lateral bullying.

Hospitals should implement anti-bullying policies and new grad transition programs. This will allow the profession of nursing to experience reduced turnover, improved patient safety outcomes, and increased job satisfaction within a positive organizational culture.

References

Dwyer, P.A., & Hunter Revell, S. M. (2016). Multilevel influences on new graduate nurse transition. *Journal for Nurses in Professional Development*, *32*(3), 112-121. https://doi.org/10.1097/NND.0000000000000265

Johnson, A. H., & Benham-Hutchins, M. (2020). The influence of bullying on nursing practice errors: a systematic review. *AORN Journal*, *111*(2), 199–210. https://doi.org/10.1002/aorn.12923

Kang, J., Kim, J.-I., & Yun, S. (2017). Effects of a cognitive rehearsal program on interpersonal relationships, workplace bullying, symptom experience, and turnover intention among nurses: a randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Korean Academy of Nursing*, *47*(5), 689–699. https://doi.org/10.4040/jkan.2017.47.5.689

Pfeifer, L. E., and Vessey, J. A. (2017). An integrative review of bullying and lateral violence among nurses in magnet® organizations. *Policy, Politics, & Nursing Practice*, *18*(3), 113–124. https://doi.org/ 10.1177/1527154418755802